Table of Contents

List of Tables v

List of Figures vi

Acknowledgments viii

Dedication: Robert B. Davis ix

Declaration x

Summary xi

CHAPTER 1 Thesis Overview 1

Introduction 1
Background and Statement of the Problem 1
What skills, when, and for whom? 3
   A “Splintered Vision” 4
   Flexible Thinking: Interpreting Mathematical Notation 7
Theoretical framework 7
Thesis 7
Research questions 8
Design and Methodology 9
General Conclusions 10
Thesis Organization 12

CHAPTER 2 General Literature Review 15

Introduction 15
The Nature of Knowledge Construction and Representation 16
Conceptual Structures 17
   Schemas and Frames 20
   Concept Images 22
   Conceptual Reorganization 24
Process-Object Theories of Cognitive Development 25
What does it mean “to understand?” 28
Ambiguous Notation: A Need for Flexible Thinking 30
   The notions of procept and the “proceptual divide” 32
The Notion of Representation 35
   External Models of Conceptual Systems 37
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Cognitive Units, Concept Images and Cognitive Collages</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction: On the Shoulders of Giants...</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conceptual Structures</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cognitive Collages, Concept Images, and Cognitive Units</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path-Dependent Logic</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Concept Maps: Representations of Cognitive Collages</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Concept Maps: Tools for Instruction and Analysis</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Thesis and Research Questions</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Piagetian Paradigm Extended</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research Design: Method and Data Collection Instruments</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Triangulation</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Variables to be taken into Consideration</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prior variables</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Independent variables</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intervening variables</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dependent variables</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consequent variables</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Data Collection</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Field Test Study</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Field, Preliminary and Main Study Pre- and Post-Course Self Evaluations</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-Course Self-Evaluation Survey</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post-Course Self-Evaluation Survey</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre- and Post-course Tests</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Relevance to Main Study Research Questions</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions that test students’ ability to take into account the role of context when evaluating an arithmetic or functional expression.</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions that test students’ ability to evaluate functions using various representational forms.</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions that test students’ ability to write an algebraic representation given the graph of a linear function.</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions that test students’ ability to recognize and take into account the role of context when evaluating a functional expression.</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions that test students’ ability to write an algebraic representation given the graph of a quadratic function.</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Main Study Pre- and Post-Test Question Classification</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Main Study Interview Question 87  
Concept Maps 88  
  Evaluation of concept maps 88  
  Revisions in use and evaluation of Concept Maps in Main Study 88  
Instructional Treatment 89  
Summary 91  

## CHAPTER 5  Preliminary Studies 93  
Introduction 93  
Field Study 94  
  Results of the Field Study: A Demographic Profile 94  
  Results of Field Study Pre- and Post-Course Attitude Responses 97  
  Results of Field Study Students’ Self Evaluation of Abilities 98  
Preliminary Study 99  
  Preliminary Study Self-evaluation Survey Results 99  
  Field & Preliminary Studies: Triangulation of Data About Prior Variables 100  
Classroom-based Qualitative Studies 104  
  Background and Problem Statement 104  
  Results of the Teaching Intervention 107  
  Analysis of the Results 108  
Use of Concept Maps 112  
Summary of Findings 114  
Conclusions 116  

## CHAPTER 6  Divergence and Fragmentation 118  
Overview of Main Study Quantitative Investigations 118  
Modifications to the Preliminary Studies Instruments 118  
A Student Profile 118  
Prior Variables: Results of Student Self-Evaluation Surveys 119  
Students’ Ability to Interpret Ambiguous Notation 125  
  Main Study Pre- and Post-Test Results 125  
Divergent Paths-Results of the Quantitative Studies 129  
Qualitative Divergence 131  
  Stability of Students’ Responses 132  
  Flexibility of Thought: Ability to Reverse a Direct Process 136  
Reconstruction of a Cognitive Collage: One Student’s Efforts 139  
  Flexibility of Thought: Translating Between Various Representations 142  
  Flexibility of Thought: Procedural vs. Conceptual Thinking 145  
Summary and Conclusions 147
Table of Contents

CHAPTER 7  A Tale of Two students  150

Introduction  150
Perceptions and Strategies  151
MC and SK: Ability to Interpret Ambiguous Notation  153
MC and SK: Ability to Think Flexibly to Reverse a Direct Process  154
Shaping and Refining the Cognitive Collages of MC and SK  159
Perceptions, Cognitive Units, Concept Images, Retrieval of Schemas  160
Two paths diverge... the path taken by MC  162
Two paths diverged...the path taken by SK  165
And they will differ...as syllable from sound  170

CHAPTER 8  Visual Representations of Cognitive Collages:  172

A look back and an overview of what is yet to come  172
The Cognitive Collages of MC and SK  174
Goals of Learning: MC and SK  179
Underlying Structure: Schematic Diagrams  181
Schematic Diagrams of Concept Maps  185
Basic Categorization Schemes  187
The Nature of Students' Classification Schemes: Most & Least Successful  190
MC and SK: A Comparison of Classification Schemes:  191
Conclusions  195

CHAPTER 9  Reflections and Future Directions  197

An Emerging Cognitive Collage of the Most/ Least Successful  197
Divergence and Fragmentation of Strategies  197
The Cognitive Collages of Two Students: MC(S2) and SK (S23)  198
Divergence and Fragmentation of Strategies: MC (S2) and SK (S23)  200
The processes of constructing cognitive collages: MC (S2) and SK (S23)  202
Reflections and Observations  203
Strengths and Weaknesses of the Study  206
Future Directions and Possibilities  207

Bibliography  210

Appendix A  Terms and Definitions  227

Appendix B  Data Collection Instruments  229

Appendix C  Student Concept Maps and Schematic Diagrams  235